Fair, Efficient and Sustainable Emission Reduction from Land Use in Indonesia (FESERLUI):

Supporting tree-based livelihoods, transparent carbon accounting and negotiation support for local communities, NGO’s and government agencies

This report was prepared for
The David and Lucile Packard Foundation
This report was prepared by: Suyanto, Efrian Muharrom, Gamma Galudra, Noviana Khususiyah, James M Roshetko, Laxman Joshi, Niken Sakuntaladewi, Meine van Noordwijk and Rodel Lasco
1. Project Overview

Indonesia has the highest greenhouse gas emissions from land use and land cover change of any country. In addition, Indonesia is responsible for the third highest overall emissions, as well as per capita emissions that fall between the levels for North America and Europe. Indonesia is a prime target for international efforts to reduce emissions from deforestation and forest degradation in developing countries (REDD). Its high current and recent levels of emissions and its large diversity of islands, situations and stakeholders provide a unique challenge for the implementation of REDD activities. High emissions in Indonesia are at least due partly to overlapping regulations and weak law enforcement, which require a strengthening of feedback systems between the center and the regions through government and civil society channels. Fair, efficient and sustainable emission reductions in Indonesia will require support for tree-based livelihoods that minimize tradeoffs between rural livelihoods and the preservation of carbon (C) stocks. Institutionally, this will require transparent carbon accounting and negotiation support systems for local communities, NGOs and government agencies.

The “Fair, Efficient and Sustainable Emission Reduction from Land Use in Indonesia (FESERLUI): Supporting tree-based livelihoods, transparent carbon accounting and negotiation support for local communities, NGO’s and government agencies” project was implemented by the Southeast Asian Regional Research Program of ICRAF – the World Agroforestry Centre, based in Bogor, in collaboration with a range of university, government, and non-government organizations (NGOs) partners at each project site.

This project has three specific goals:

1. To support the learning process for local stakeholders in a minimum of five representative landscapes of Indonesia, by recognizing the value chain involved in market-based incentives for maintaining and increasing terrestrial C stocks, using the “fairness versus efficiency” contrast;
2. To support the systematic analysis of the local forest landscape realities and develop innovative solutions through the institutional combination of A/R-CDM (afforestation/reforestation Clean Development Mechanism) and REDD mechanisms to support landscape-scale livelihood enhancement in selected parts of Indonesia; and
3. To support the emergence of checks and balances between national and local stakeholders though transparent C accounting and monitoring that links a network of ‘ground-truthing’ data to satellite-based observation methods.
Expected outcomes are:

- A network of Indonesian ‘learning landscapes’ involving local stakeholders, who are better prepared for active participation in national-level negotiations on REDD and similar mechanisms of C accounting;
- Increased stakeholder appreciation of the need to balance efficiency as well as fairness in REDD implementation mechanisms that enable the design of more effective communication material;
- Improved versions of generic appraisal tools for landscape level change in C stocks and the ways financial and other incentives can be constructed.

The project approach was designed to have a broad reach through the three identified representative stakeholder groups: NGOs, government agencies, and universities. Workshops were held at each of the six sites to review the REDD concept, the FERSULUI project, and the interest/capacity of local partners. Following each workshop, partners identified to have sufficient capacity and local knowledge were provided with sub-grants to conduct research activities and achieve project objectives using the FERSULUI methodologies.

Besides meeting its own objectives, which are focused on the socioeconomics of local stakeholders and their negotiation support systems, the FERSULUI project complements the ALLREDDI (Accountability and Local Level Initiative to Reduce Emission from Deforestation and Degradation in Indonesia) project, which focuses on technical aspects, such as carbon measurement and spatial planning.

The project was implemented on Indonesia's five largest islands, which represent the socioeconomic, biophysical, and governance/institutional conditions prevalent in the country. Jambi, in Sumatra, was selected as a project site because excellent data was available and institutional capacity and support from local government and NGOs were high. WARS, a local NGO with a strong reputation at the local, provincial and national levels, has collaborated effectively with ICRAF on several projects. Forest conditions and threat levels in Jambi represent the Sumatera case quite well. The Central Kalimantan site was selected because the area is the first REDD demonstration site in Indonesia that was funded by AUSAID, and this site also represents a study on peat. Within Indonesia, the peat lands of Central Kalimantan are a recognized hotspot for emissions. In addition, the recent establishment of the regional forest office in South Kalimantan and its mandate provides synergy with ALLREDDI capacity-building objectives in carbon accounting at the provincial level. Gorontalo, in Sulawesi, was selected because of its good forest condition and medium threat level, while other characteristics do not vary greatly from general conditions in Sulawesi. Papua, as an island, has almost uniformly low levels of data availability and institutional capacity, while being high in forest cover and also threats. The Jayapura site was
selected because local conditions are representative of Papua in general and because there is a regional forest office. On Java, the Pasuruan district is situated in low forest cover, has a high population density, the existence of certified Hutan Rakyat (Forest People) and it is also represented in the social forestry program by Perhutani (State Timber Company).

1.1. Materials delivered that can be used as initial appraisal tools by local stakeholders

The Negotiation Support System (NSS) is an approach to integrated natural resource management (iNRM) that recognizes the multiple layers of decision making and the need for negotiations between them. The main elements of NSS are:

- Connecting the biophysical (ecological) part of the analysis to socio-economic concerns and political realities;
- Having a ‘toolbox’ for shared analysis of scenarios or plausible futures for the lives and landscapes at stake;
- Empowering groups that normally don’t have access to science to reduce asymmetry of access to credible results; and
- Supporting direct stakeholder negotiations, but maintaining the integrity of science and its associated uncertainties.

Tools for analysis have been created by ICRAF (See Figure 1). We used some of these tools for this project.

![Figure 1. Agroforestry Carbon Management Tools](image)

**Agroforestry ~ Carbon management toolbox based on TUL-SEA**

- **Initial appraisal of context**
  - PALA: Landscape
  - DriLUC: Drivers of land use change
  - PAPPOLD: Rural poverty
  - RAFT: Agroforestry systems & technology
  - PAM: Profitability analysis matrix
  - RMA: Market access
  - RaTA: Tenure claims

- **RaCSA**: Carbon stocks
- **RASA**: Spatial analysis of patterns and LU change
  - **(ROSA)**: Oxygen supply
- **Fallow**: Landscape scenarios, baselines
- **NSS**: Negotiation support process
- **Supportive**
  - Wood density
  - FBA: tree architecture
  - Tree*Site matching
- **WNoTree**: Constraint analysis
- **FERVA**: Fair & efficient value chains for REDD

**Fair and Efficient REDD Value Chain Allocation (FERVA)**

REDD is a proposed international agreement to *Reduce Emissions from Deforestation and Degradation in developing countries*, Research on how REDD could be implemented and on
how to achieve its goal are currently under investigation in many locations. The FERVA method was designed to contribute to this on-going process. In reducing emissions from deforestation, forest degradation, peatlands, and other land uses in developing countries, a major challenge is determining how to combine efficiency and fairness. A middle-ground approach and a combination of policy instruments are needed to actually reduce emissions and also stimulate sustainable livelihood options and development pathways. FERVA is based on ‘focus group discussions’ with different stakeholder groups. Details and examples are flexible to adjust to local contexts. Within FESERLUI, this method was used repeatedly to monitor learning curves and shifts in perceptions among stakeholders.

Institutional Setting
The institutional setting provides instructive material that assists local stakeholders to develop institutions that can design, manage and implement REDD schemes. Either new institutions can be established or existing institutions optimized. The material stresses the importance of addressing stakeholders’ aspirations and existing governmental regulations, so that the objective of a sustainable reduction in emissions can be achieved. The implementation and management of REDD schemes are not only concerned with local priorities and activities; the schemes must also comply with national policy and international agreements. Therefore, knowing the relevant REDD regulatory framework and related principles is essential.

WNoTree = Barrier Analysis for Tree Enhancement
Current relationships between agroforestry and plantation forestry are perceived to be complementary, neutral or competitive, depending on the ability of (inter)national policy frameworks to provide a level playing field for all components of society to benefit from the productive and protective functions of forests. Large-scale plantations may operate with substantial government subsidies (direct, indirect, or partly justified by environmental service functions). In contrast, agroforestry systems receive no or minimal subsidies. Thus, the potential of agroforestry systems to produce tree products and ecological services is placed at a disadvantage, to the detriment of society at large.

WNoTree surveys generally have three stages: i) developing and evaluating a check-list of relevant issues to identify the most significant constraints to tree planting and management in the local context; ii) design follow-up surveys to test the hypotheses that emerge from the first stage, in combination with spatial analysis to identify actual tree presence in the landscape; and iii) action research engagement with local stakeholders (communities, civil society, and governments) to address the primary constraints, and provide a direct test of the preceding analysis.

RaTA = Rapid Tenure claim Assessment
Land tenure conflicts are common in many developing countries where often traditional land rights are not codified, leaving local populations defenceless against a change in the legal
status of their traditional lands. The RaTA approach helps explore the nature of those competing claims. It aims to seek and reveal the competing perceived legal claims among various stakeholders, who hold different rights and interests. By analyzing the effect of policies on land conflicts and competing tenure claims, RaTA can provide policy options and interventions as alternative solutions to settle land conflicts. Within FESERLUI, the RaTA method has provided key options to achieve both ‘fairness’ and ‘efficiency’, by clarifying the rights of various stakeholders and the nature of current conflicts that may need to be reduced (if not resolved) before REDD schemes can be confidently implemented.

**RMA = Rapid Marketing Appraisal**

RMA is a tool to understand how a product or commodity flows to end-users and how the commodity value chain is organized, operates and performs. RMAs demonstrate the value of market information. RMAs help farmers learn more about the commodities they produce by identifying the value chain, commodity specifications, and customers’ needs. Smallholder farmers and other stakeholders begin to see why it is important to listen to customers and to understand their markets. Within FESERLUI, the RMA method helps to assess tree-based alternative livelihood options.
2. Project Activities

2.1 Capacity Building Training

2.1.1 Partnership Establishment
Selecting the right key partners plays an important role in positioning the project to achieve its objective successfully. Partner selection and partnership establishment should not be done haphazardly over a short period. To build effective partnerships, ICRAF evaluated a range of stakeholders at each site through a series of meetings and ongoing communication using emails and telephone calls. This process also served to gather relevant information concerning local conditions. Following selection, a set of training materials was prepared for each partner, to enable them to address local conditions and needs in line with project objectives.

As a primary guideline for the partners in implementing the training, ICRAF prepared terms of reference, which differed according to each site’s unique and representative conditions. Partners were required to submit a proposed budget for the training activities. Following review and negotiation of the training agenda and budget, letters of agreement were signed with each partner.

2.1.2 Focus Group Discussion
One of the training objectives was to gather information from local stakeholders concerning important emission reduction issues. A *Focus Group Discussion (FGD)* methodology was used to facilitate rapid gathering of information, stimulate effective discussion to crosscheck information, and build partnerships among stakeholders. After explanatory presentations, the participants were divided into relevant sub-groups with facilitators to discuss the key issues and compile relevant information and experiences. A summary of the main sessions held follows:

a. **Fairness and Efficiency Session.** Sub-groups were formed, based on the preference of participants. A key objective of the session was to gain insight into the various reasoning processes due to differing institutional settings. Each sub-group was asked to express its reasoning and arguments on why REDD schemes should be implemented, based on the concept of preferences, fairness or efficiency. Each sub-group presented its reasoning and arguments in plenary. The session ended, when all sub-groups reached a mutual understanding regarding the importance of fairness and efficiency in REDD scheme implementation.

b. **Value Chain Session.** Sub-groups were formed based on participants’ institutional association and background, to facilitate the discovery of different institutional points of view and preferences for REDD fund value chain allocation. The value chain of REDD
was introduced to the participants (Figure 2), and sub-groups were requested to allocate percentages to the eight REDD value chain functions. Sub-groups could add or remove individual functions if they perceived it to be necessary in order to achieve the sustainable emission reduction goal.

![Figure 2. Value chain of REDD](image)

c. **Institutional Setting Session.** The process used to form sub-groups differed by site. At some training sites, participants were divided, based on the questions posed during the session, while at others they were divided, based on their interests, from either answering questions or analyzing the Ministry of Forestry REDD regulations. The questions posed during the session stressed the necessity of creating an institution to manage the implementation of the REDD scheme and REDD funds distribution in a manner that complied with national and international regulations, as well as their principles. Critiquing (inclusive of criticizing) Ministry of Forestry REDD regulations were found to be productive, as an evaluation process by first-hand actors who would have to implement REDD schemes and be compliant with national policy and international regulations.

d. **Why No Tree? Barrier Analysis for Tree Planting (WnoTree) Session.** Sub-groups were formed according to the institutional association of participants, in order to classify experience in tree planting programs, based on institutional capacity, approaches, and qualifications. Each sub-group was requested to conduct a barrier analysis exercise on a selected tree-planting or reforestation project example. The analysis followed the if-then-scenario process to identify key tree-planting barriers, the severity of the barriers, and possible courses of action.
e. Rapid Tenure Assessment (RaTA) Session. Participants were organized into sub-groups based on their interest in related local- or provincial-level issues. Session discussion focused on tenure conflict related to traditional (local) claims and legal (provincial or national) claims and how to clarify related carbon rights and responsibilities.

f. Rapid Marketing Appraisal (RMA) Session. Sub-groups were focused on the two-or-three most valuable commodities based on participants’ perception. Participants joined the sub-group of their choice, with the precaution taken to ensure group sizes were balanced. Sub-groups were requested to plan a market evaluation, based on the guidelines/criteria provided, including: budget estimation, market actors, market channels, product specifications, and market demands.

2.2 Sub-Grant Activities and Research

Central Kalimantan
The FERVA method was replicated in Kapuas Regency, Central Kalimantan in order to explore the regional impact of the introduction of REDD issues. An RMA was conducted to identify the market potential for an NTFP (non timber forest product) commodity that was common in Central Kalimantan community and had high potential as one component of a REDD scheme to provide sustainable alternative livelihoods to local communities.

JAMBI
The FERVA method was implemented in Muara Bungo, Jambi to document the differences in provincial and regency level perceptions, regarding the introduction of issues related to REDD schemes. Muara Bungo was selected as the site for implementing the FERVA due to the existence of the ICRAF field office and the availability of a detailed socioeconomic, policy, and biophysical information of relevance to the development of REDD schemes. Additionally, Muara Bungo includes well-preserved forests and well-developed agroforests.

In Jambi, a large amount of private sector capital has been invested in the oil palm sector and there is a historical trend of the government issuing land conversion permits, without consideration of existing traditional land claims. An RaTA was conducted to resolve conflicting land claim issues and prevent further negative impacts that might result from the development of an REDD scheme.

Gorontalo
An institutional setting exercise was implemented in Gorontalo to assist this newly established province evaluate REDD schemes as one of the various management
options for their land resources, and enhance the capacity of government staff and other stakeholders in land use planning and implementation.

**Pasuruan-East Java**

The value of timber in Java is relatively high compared to other locations in Indonesia. This condition influences the land use options of local communities, the land management costs, and their land use decisions. Their land use management decisions to harvest or not harvest timber, effect CO₂ emissions into the atmosphere. As carbon is a marketable commodity under REDD schemes, not harvesting or reducing the intensity of harvesting may be a viable decision to make alternative land use options possible. An RMA was designed and implemented to compare various community-based timber production options with REDD schemes.

**Jaya Pura-Papua**

An institutional setting study was implemented at the Jayapura site to develop an institutional framework to evaluate the preparation and implementation of an REDD scheme under provincial and local conditions. A key part of the study was to evaluate REDD against other options. Stakeholders were keen to evaluate the provincial and local readiness for REDD as the euphoria of REDD being an easy path to additional income and investment was beginning to wane. The experiences of several Indonesian provinces have shown that a lack of knowledge and capacity can result in REDD projects with unforeseen commitments and unexpected land use restrictions that effect provincial development.
3. Project Activities and Achievements

The following section outlines the activities undertaken by the Project and the outputs delivered in accordance to the Project Log frame and Schedule of Activities.

3.1 Summary of Activities

3.1.1 Table 1 and table 2 provides a summary of activities implemented and achievements against the Project Schedule of Activities

Table 1. Capacity building workshop in six sites, lead by ICRAF and Collaborators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project sites</th>
<th>Achievements/Indicators</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Central Kalimantan</td>
<td>Completed. The workshop was planned and conducted by ICRAF and Wetlands International Indonesia Program (WIIP)</td>
<td>The workshop complements the activities of the AUSAID Kalimantan Forests and Climate Partnership (KFCP) pilot project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jambi</td>
<td>Completed. The workshop was planned and conducted by ICRAF and KKI WARS</td>
<td>Representatives of local communities attending the workshop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gorontalo</td>
<td>Completed. The workshop was planned and conducted by ICRAF and the State University of Gorontalo</td>
<td>The workshop was a follow-up to REDD working group training previously conducted by stakeholders at the site</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pasuruan – East Java</td>
<td>Completed. The workshop was planned and conducted by ICRAF, Kaliandra Sejati Foundation, and local partners of the foundation</td>
<td>The workshop complements previous activities conducted at the site through the Clinton Foundation project and Brawijaya University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jayapura - Papua</td>
<td>Completed. The workshop, a joint-activity with the ALLREDDI Project, was planned and conducted by ICRAF and the Natural Resource Conservation Agency (BKSDA)</td>
<td>Participants were local government, civil society, and university partners of the ALLREDDI Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Kalimantan</td>
<td>Completed. The workshop was planned and conducted by ICRAF and the University of Lambungmangkurat (UNLAM)</td>
<td>The workshop was held based on partnership with a participant of ALLREDDI project training from UNLAM</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Research activities carried out by collaborators and ICRAF

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Achievements/Indicators</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fair, Efficient and Sustainable Emission Reduction from Land Use in Indonesia (FESERLUI) workshop in Kapuas, Central Kalimantan</td>
<td>Completed. The workshop was conducted by WIIP and BAPPEDA (Local Development and Planning Agency), Kapuas Regency</td>
<td>A representative of ICRAF attended the workshop and deliver an opening speech</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RMA for smallholder rubber conducted to increase farmer market access</td>
<td>Completed. The research was conducted by Environment Training, Education and Study Institute (LP3LH)</td>
<td>The research report has been submitted to ICRAF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment of REDD Policy and Distribution Payment in Gorontalo Province</td>
<td>Completed. The study was conducted by a team of participants from the capacity building workshop held previously (see Table 1 above). Membership included university, government agencies, and NGOs</td>
<td>The study is intended to establish the Gorontalo REDD working group. Progress to date is good.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activities</td>
<td>Achievements/Indicators</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fair, Efficient and Sustainable Emission Reduction from Land Use in Indonesia (FESERLUI) workshop in Muara Bungo, Jambi</td>
<td>Completed. The workshop was conducted collaboratively by ICRAF (Bogor and Muara Bungo Offices) and District Forest Agency of Muara Bungo</td>
<td>The workshop was attended by stakeholders, as well as, local communities and private companies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Conflict in Forest Resource Utilization (Case Study of Twelve Hills National Park (TNBD), Province of Jambi)</td>
<td>Completed. The study was conducted by an IPB student as a master thesis</td>
<td>The study used the RaTA approach</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| RMA to assess market chain for Suren (*Toona surenii*) and Sengon (*Paraserianthes falcataria*) in Pasuruan Regency, East Java. | Completed  
Study was conducted by ICRAF student as a master thesis  
The analysis was led by Kaliandra Sejati Foundation and conducted by a team of stakeholders who attended the previous training | Study results are expected to be the reference to decide if the area is competitive enough to implant an REDD scheme |
| Questioning Papua Readiness: Key Efforts by the Provincial Government for the Success of REDD in the Context of Special Autonomy (Otonomi Khusus) | Completed. The study was conducted by ICRAF  
Brief report is available |        |
| Bungo Carbon Program: Forest Preservation and Climate Change Mitigation Concept | Completed  
The meeting was arranged by ICRAF Muara Bungo, Forestry and Crop Estate Agency of Muara Bungo district, and FGLG (Forest and Governance Learning Group) | The meeting is expected to be the embryo of a district REDD working group |
| Field Facilitation of villages surrounding Bukit Panjang Rantau Bayur area, Bungo District | Completed  
The activity was arranged and carried out by KKI WARSI | Report is available |
| Colombia University Students Research: A Framework for Understanding REDD in Muara Bungo | In Progress  
Three students work in group for ICRAF in order to complete of their master study | Report will be available on May 2010 |
| People Forest and Agroforestry Role as Carbon Stock at Prigen Sub district, Pasuruan District | In Progress  
Sub grant was given to support Brawijaya University Student, for the completion of their study and also to support the development of Pasuruan, East Java | Report will be in the form of an undergraduate thesis and will be available in February 2010 |
| Roles of Trees in Stabilizing Cliffs in Prigen Subdistrict, Pasuruan District | In Progress  
Same as above | Same as above |
3.1.2 Participate in meetings and workshops related to REDD

1. Public Consultation on REDD, held by Indonesian Forestry Department
2. Carbon Trade Initiative Development in Community-Based Forest Management in Indonesia, held by KPWN and LEI
3. UNREDD Public Consultation, held by UNDP
4. Challenges and Opportunities on REDD, held by Baker and Mc Kenzie
5. Public Consultation on Reference Emission Levels (REL), held by Indonesian Forestry Department
6. Indonesia REDD Readiness Strategy, held by Indonesian Forestry Department

3.2 Outputs under the Project

3.2.1 Capacity building workshop in six sites, lead by ICRAF and Collaborators

a) Participants attending the workshops

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project Site</th>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Materials Provided</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gov</td>
<td>NGO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Palangka Raya (Central Kalimantan)</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jambi</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gorontalo</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pasuruan (east java)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jayapura (Papua)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Banjarbaru (South Kalimantan)</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* List of participants is attached in an appendix. Gov = Government, Univ = University, Other = Donor, Community, etc.
** The materials used at the workshops are described in the following pages. Prior to the workshop, ICRAF and key stakeholders analyzed local conditions to determine the tools most relevant to the site.

Overall, 155 local stakeholders attended the workshops across the project sites, and more than 40% of participants were NGO’s.
b) Increased stakeholder understanding of climate change and issues related to mitigation efforts

For most local stakeholders, REDD is a new concept. They believe it favors the interests of some government institutions, NGOs, or elite individuals. Only a few government institutions and national NGOs are actively involved in REDD. Their common understanding on REDD is that it entails the sustainable management of the forest in order to get money from developed countries as compensation for the carbon those countries emit. It is seen as a means to generate a large amount of money by selling carbon without cutting trees. However, many of these stakeholders are unaware of what carbon is, what it looks like and other essential technical aspects, such as: additionality; the effectiveness of REDD schemes; rights and responsibilities; and penalties. This leads to scepticism by many stakeholders regarding the potential success of implementing REDD schemes; however, other stakeholders remain positive.

To address the awareness and knowledge gap, the World Agroforestry Centre (ICRAF) held the series of workshops mentioned above to inform the stakeholders at the project sites. Focal topics of the workshops included: 1) climate change and its impact on the future environment and livelihood risk; 2) schemes developed to mitigate climate change and their differences (CDM and REDD); 3) important issues related to local level readiness in supporting and implementing an REDD scheme (REDD value chain allocation, land tenure, institutional setting, commodity marketing, and tree-based livelihoods).

c) Changes in stakeholders perspective regarding REDD implementation issues

Overviews of REDD were delivered in the first session of each workshop. The presentations stressed the importance of fairness and efficiency in the scheme implementation. Participants then self-selected into working groups on key issues of their preference to discuss why and how REDD schemes could be implemented. After the working group discussions, all groups reconvened in plenary to provide presentations on their reasoning on how REDD should be implemented.
At first, most working groups insisted that their preferential issue should be the principal factor in implementing REDD. But following discussions led by ICRAF facilitators, working groups realized that while all issues were important depending on the characteristics of the sites, the issue of fairness and efficiency in the REDD scheme was principal to successful implementation at all sites.

d) Initiation of activities as an embryo for forming REDD working group

Many of the local stakeholders perceived that the REDD scheme was an important opportunity to support the development of their region, therefore they wanted follow-up after the workshop. ICRAF supported this local aspiration by delivering information to enhance awareness and by giving sub-grants to conduct prioritized activities as the starting point to establishing an REDD working group or commission. General guidelines in forming initial teams and planning/conducting activities were also provided; additionally ICRAF staff members were available for consultation and further support as required.

3.2.2 Research activities carried out by collaborators and ICRAF

a) Fair, Efficient and Sustainable Emission Reduction from Land Use in Indonesia (FESERLUI) Workshop in Kapuas, Central Kalimantan

Duplication of the workshop was essential in order to expand the number of stakeholder participants and increase the level of local stakeholder understanding and awareness of REDD scheme issues. This approach was intended to lead to full support at the local level and successful implementation of REDD schemes.

This regency level workshop was organized and facilitated by the Wetlands International Indonesian Program (WIIP) in Kapuas and it was attended by 33 participants, representing regional government agencies, universities, private companies, and NGOs. The material delivered related to Fair, Efficient REDD Value Chain Allocation (FERVA) and REDD value chain allocation through FGDs.
b) Market Chain Analysis for Rubber Commodities to Increase Farmer Access to Markets (An RMA study in Mentangai District, regency of Kapuas, Central Kalimantan)

For generations, the communities in Mantangai sub-district have been managing rubber cultivation; however, their ability to access the market has not changed significantly. In this area, every day after tapping, farmers process latex into slabs by a simple process. After approximately one week, the slab rubber is carried out to temporary farmer storage (near the plantation/village), to await the trade transaction with the gatherer, which is usually done one to two times in the month. On the other hand, the local government effort over this time has only focused on incremental increases in the productivity of the farmed rubber plantations, while efforts to improve market management, including the rubber price, have remained minimal.

Based on observation, the rubber market potential in Kapuas regency sub-districts is substantial, for the local and regional markets. The local market mainly can be directed to provide rubber-processing material (bokar/bahan olah karet) in the form of slabs to the crumb rubber industry in Kuala Kapuas (the Kapuas Regency capital), and to the regional market to support the crumb rubber industry in Banjarmasin (the South Kalimantan province capital).

In Mentangai sub-district, two kinds of rubber-processing material are produced, and both have a different marketing chain. The "plung" rubber involves four marketing actors, being the farmer, village collector, retailer, and factory, while "takuluk" rubber only involves three marketing actors, being the farmer, retailer, and factory.

The marketing functions, involving both community rubber marketing channels in Mentangai sub-district, cover exchange functions (selling and purchasing), physical functions (transportation, storage, processing), and facilitation functions (financing, standardization, and grading). The role of farmers in community rubber marketing in Mentangai sub-district is still the lowest (14.29%) compared with other marketing actors, such as retailers (36.73%) and village collectors and factories, which are each 24.49%.

The two products also have differences in cost, benefits, margin, farmer share, and efficiency. Due to the huge price differences and the number of actors involved in the plunge rubber marketing system, the farmers’ share and marketing efficiency are low, being 40% and 60%, respectively. However, in the takuluk rubber marketing system, farmers’ share and market efficiency were relatively high, being 66.67% and 33.33%, respectively.

Many development strategies can be implemented to increase rubber market access by the farmers in Mentangai sub-district, including: a) develop farmer income sources, so that the farmer can produce a higher quality of rubber processing material; b) develop a Village Unit Cooperative (KUD) to replace the role of the village collector and retailer, so that the rubber farmers are able to gain benefits from rubber marketing; and c) develop partnerships between
farmers and the crumb rubber factory, to shorten the existing marketing chain, so that the farmers are able to gain a higher share and optimize market efficiency.

c) Assessment of REDD Policy and Distribution Payment in Gorontalo Province

The threat of climate change has urged the world to take steps to reduce carbon emissions. REDD is an incentive mechanism that is expected to reduce emissions and protect the environment. REDD schemes were to be discussed/developed in the aftermath of other failed efforts to reduce emissions and protect the environment. As everywhere, REDD is a new concept in Gorontalo province. It is seen as a concept that will benefit the political elite, NGOs, and elite individuals. Only a few government institutions and national NGOs are actively involved in the process.

REDD, which is based on the utilization of non-timber forest uses and local community empowerment, is not understood yet by most stakeholders. In the province, forests are still primarily perceived as providing a timber-production landuse, which is not restricted for community use. The understanding of forest utilization for non-timber forest products is focused on environmental services (tourism, education, and carbon sequestration), but requires further clarification. The same case exists with REDD-related socialization efforts; further understandings is required concerning the characteristics of carbon stocks, responsibilities, rights, and REDD scheme options, as well as punishment for those who defy REDD agreements.

Assessment of the attitudes of government institutions and community organizations towards the implementation of REDD schemes in Gorontalo province indicates their high potential, with great interest shown by NGOs and government stakeholders (provincial forestry and mining agencies, local government technical agencies, local civil governments, environmental research and technology bodies). Community forest monitoring and management has been identified as an important step to optimize REDD institutional structures and REDD support activities.

In conclusion, REDD implementation in Gorontalo is still facing key problems, such as: transparency in the funding mechanism; limitations on human resources (particularly in carbon accounting); and effective national and local regulatory instruments.

d) Fair, Efficient and Sustainable Emission Reduction from Land Use in Indonesia (FESERLUI) Workshop in Muara Bungo, Jambi

The workshop was held in Muara Bungo district and attended by 30 participants from local governments, universities, NGOs, private companies and representatives from several villages. It was conducted by the Muara Bungo District Forestry and Estate Crop Agency (Dinas Kehutanan dan Perkebunan Kabupaten Muara Bungo) with assistance from ICRAF.
The materials delivered through FGD were FERVA and the institutional setting. Key results are detailed below.

i) Arguments on REDD implementation based on the issue of Fairness or Efficiency
Participants were divided into groups based on their preferences regarding the two issues related to the principle for implementing REDD. The following main arguments were expressed.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fairness</th>
<th>Efficiency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Rewards need to be provided to communities already protecting, preserving, and sustainably managing local forest resources.</td>
<td>1. Incentives should be given to private companies in order to support intensification efforts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Fair distribution of REDD funds is essential and workable guidelines are required.</td>
<td>2. Human resources need to be enhanced in term of the skills required to engage in ‘alternative livelihoods’ that replace the opportunities lost due to the implementation of REDD schemes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. In order to improve community welfare, REDD should involve all stakeholders who are using the local forests.</td>
<td>3. Community welfare opportunities need to be expanded, to reduce dependence on forest resources.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ii) Institutional setting and REDD fund distribution mechanism
Institutionalization is an essential support mechanism in the successful implementation of REDD schemes, because it determines the responsible parties, their role, and rights. Muara Bungo district is quite advanced in preparing their REDD support structure and scheme, because there are various community-managed forest areas, such as Lubuk Beringin forest village, the adat forests of Pelepat New Village, Batu Kerbau and Senamat Ulu which already have an established institution to manage their forest. This potential can be utilized for distribution of the REDD fund.

e) Social Conflict in Forest Resource Utilization (Case Study of Twelve Hills National Park (TNBD), Province of Jambi)
Conflicting interests between different stakeholder groups surrounding TNBD have been the source of latent conflict, which arose from the tense situation associated with the utilization of the forest surrounding TNBD. There was an expectation from two contradictory objectives (conservation and continuity of Orang Rimba life), with regard to fulfilling the needs of the communities in surrounding villages for social insurance, which was oriented towards the expansion of field cultivation. This was the main “runway” to develop the TNBD management concept. The study findings reflected that it was wrong if all national parks with various characteristics and issues were managed under a general management concept. In this context, there is a need to develop a discussion framework, where a national
park should not be considered important only for forest ecosystem conservation purposes, but should also provide cultural conservation and protection from the outside world pressure for stranded communities. Culture conservation does not have to mean only efforts to preserve primitivism, but rather should involve an effort to provide space to the stranded community to reproduce values and transform socio-culturally with dynamic social changes.

From the aforementioned explanation, it can be concluded that manifest conflict and latent conflict over forest resource utilization are products from a one-party forest management policy. The forest management policy also contributes to the production pattern changes, social structure, and community culture in surrounding villages and Orang Rimba that live within the forest area.

The decreasing forest areas are pressuring government efforts to preserve the remaining forest through the establishment of conservation forests in the form of either National Park, Biosphere Reserve, Suaka Margasatwa, Taman Hutan Raya, Peat Protected Forest, or City Forest. In addition, forest management policy has given latitude to the community to manage the protected forest through Adat Forest, Village Forest, Forbidden Forest, Community Forest, Kampung Forest, Rakyat Forest, and lately a system called Rakyat Plantation Forest. On the other hand, since the establishment of regional autonomy, forest areas are becoming the target to provide support for the increment of Local Original Income (PAD), which is causing massive forest conversion to develop large-scale plantations with investor support. It should be remembered that the forest area is now limited and the remaining forest is predominantly for conservation or protection. On the other hand, the number of groups with an interest in the forest is increasing. Therefore, access to the forest is competitive and the resulting pressure is on the protected forests, which mainly have national park status. Current forest areas contain natural resources that many parties are fighting for, including the state (for protected areas and transmigration resettlement), private companies (oil palm and industrial plantation forest), and the local community (agricultural fields expansion, timber and non-timber resource exploitation). In some areas, the competition has evolved into open conflict. Several studies, which have been carried out in several national parks, showed high levels of social conflict had occurred vertically or horizontally.

f) Assessment of Market Chain for Suren (*Toona surenii*) and Sengon (*Paraserianthes falcataria*) in Pasuruan Regency, East Java.

Sengon plantation trends in Sekarmojo, Sumberrejo, Tejowangi and Cendono Village, in the Pasuruan sub district of the Pasuruan district have occurred over a five-year period. However, there is no statistical data available on the production capacity of the whole Sengon plantation sector. The RMA study found that in Sengon marketing, 100% of the Sengon farmers sold their timber based on the standing stem, so that the whole tree belonged to the buyer after this transaction had occurred. There are no exact tree prices at the farmer level, because
when the Lord purchase Sengon tree from the farmer through the wholesale system, the payment was calculated based on tree amount, quality and cost of management.

There are five components in the marketing chain from the producer (farmer) to the consumer (Sengon timber processor); the marketing actors are: farmer, gatherer, sawmill, wood processing home industry, and consumer, with the role of each actor in decreasing order being: wood processing home industry (31%), sawmill (26%), gatherer (23%), consumer (18%), and farmer (2%). Sengon wood processing and marketing cover: Sengon tree selling, timber selling, board selling, and pallet selling.

In addition to Sengon, Suren tree silviculture in Dayurejo and Jatirejo villages, in the Prigen sub district of the Pasuruan district, started just two years ago and are yet to be harvested with an area of 50 ha, which has been planted with a mixture of 95% Suren trees and 5% Sengon trees.

Based on the study, the following recommendations were made:
1. Individually, farmers are expected to sell Sengon in the form of timber, because they can earn more benefit from the wood (81%) and branches (18%), with only 11% in costs from the total benefit. The benefit does not include the tree price itself.
2. In terms of cutting Sengon trees into timber, farmers do not need to purchase a chainsaw, but can rent one or form a group and create a Sengon tree sawmilling business.
3. Supporting and urging an FMU (Forest Management Unit) institution as developed by the Purwosari sub district in Pasuran district as an institution that can increase the welfare of wood-owning farmers from the people’s forest through a wood market guarantee and people wood certification.
4. There is a need for area potential analysis, which can be developed through a cooperation model involving the related parties (mainly Perhutani and the company) in Sengon silviculture in the Perhutani area.

**g) Questioning Papua Readiness: Key Efforts by the Provincial Government for the Success of REDD in the Context of Special Autonomy (Otonomi Khusus)**

State forested land in Papua province covers 90% of the total land area (31 million ha), representing 24% of all forest cover in Indonesia. However, the forest boundary does not correspond to actual forest cover, but rather represents a compromise between local governments and the Ministry of Forestry (MoF) in areas where MoF has jurisdiction over forest management or the creation of timber plantations. However, the 2001 Papua Special Autonomy Law changed the situation. This law devolved the forest governance structure and management to the Papua Government, but also placed designated-state forest areas under the control of customary (adat) rights. Papua’s interest in becoming involved in REDD schemes has been demonstrated by the five MOUs that have been signed by the Papua
Governor with private companies and NGOs, but only one of the MOUs is still valid. The studies aimed to evaluate the preparedness of Papua to implement REDD schemes, especially in the context of special autonomy (otonomi khusus). The study covers two main issues that require clarity within the REDD context: land tenure security and institutional arrangements.

Institutional Reform and Arrangements: Institutional Setting, Distribution Mechanism and Customary Tenure: In 2007, Barnabas Suebu, (the Governor of Papua, Indonesia), through a declaration agreed to an action plan, which called for compensation for reduced greenhouse gas emissions from deforestation and protection of standing forests. Since this declaration, the Papua Government has applied several institutional reforms to develop the enabling conditions required for REDD. Primarily, these institutional reforms were intended to protect and sustain local people’s livelihood through the recognition of customary rights. The Papua Government argues that REDD schemes should deliver benefits to local communities, so that they continue to have an incentive to protect and manage forest. These reforms also include the development of a new village-level program on fund distribution mechanisms. These efforts protect communities against the risk of elite appropriation through the development of “imagined communities” that could compete with real communities for access to REDD funding. The key efforts taken by the Papua Government to facilitate REDD development are summarized below:

1. A designated Forest Management Unit (FMU) for forest sustainability;
2. Community driven development (including the development of RESPEK, village bank accounts); and
3. Recognize and protect customary tenure through Special Government Regulation (Perdasus) on ‘Sustainable Forest Management with Papua Customary Law Communities’ and ‘Papua Customary Law Communities Rights’.

Other Key Efforts that Need to be Addressed for REDD: Homework for the Provincial Government of Papua: The future of the forest ecosystems in Papua is of great importance globally in terms of climate change, biodiversity and water cycles, and locally in terms of adat land rights and resource decision making. Forests also represent very significant economic resources. Below are several issues that the Provincial Government of Papua should address before the REDD schemes can be implemented:

1. Coordination with other government agencies at all levels (national through local);
2. Develop payment distribution system and financial reward for the stewardship of the forest carbon resource by customary communities;
3. Achieve a practical and just resolution to the relationship between customary ownership, based on Perdasus, and statutory law;
4. Identify the REDD institutional setting for carbon management and monitoring; and
5. Building capacity in the provincial and district government to implement land-use decision making in relation to forest resources.
h) Bungo Carbon Program: Forest Preservation and Climate Change Mitigation Concept (embryo of REDD working group in Bungo)

The community-based sustainable forest management program is a form of forest management oriented towards achieving forest sustainability with regard to adat/local community livelihood through self-action. Historically, local/adat communities have depended on managing the forest based on their knowledge of and ability to utilize the indigenous species. Community-based sustainable forest management can be achieved if there the legal instruments and policy are in place that side with community interests. The recognition of the community’s rights to the forest can be implemented by empowering local institutions with knowledge in managing forests.

Based on the MoF regulation No. 68/MoF-II/2008 concerning REDD funding arrangements and MoF regulation No. 30/MoF-II/2009 concerning the climate change framework convention, to implement REDD requires clear institutional and REDD payment distribution processes. The institution is needed to determine who is responsible and what their role is, and therefore determine the success of REDD implementation.

Bungo district is a suitable recipient of the REDD compensation fund, because in this area there are plenty of community-managed areas, such as: the village forest in Lubuk Beringin which is already subject to the MoF decree; the adat forests of Baru Pelepat village, Batu Kerbau and Senamat Ulu. In addition, following a decree by the district head, an REDD working group is in the process of being formed.

To support the preparations in Bungo district, there have been several actions undertaken, including two focus group discussions, with the first held in the Forest and Crop Estate Agency in July 2009 and the second in BAPPEDA during November 2009.

The Bungo district government felt that they needed to develop the REDD scheme in Bungo to respond to the emerging carbon trade opportunities at the international level. These meetings were attended by the head of SKPD and Bungo DPRD, which resulted in the formation of the REDD management working group.

i) Field Facilitation of Villages Surrounding the Bukit Panjang Rantau Bayur area, Bungo District

In Indonesia, contested rules between the state and local communities over the use and protection of forest areas have been recognized as threats to forests, their biodiversity, carbon stocks and watershed functions, as well as to local livelihoods. A recent regulation by the Indonesian Minister of Forestry (No. P.49/Menhut-II/2008) detailed how a ‘village forest’ (‘Hutan Desa’) status could reconcile the forest management targets and livelihood interests of the villagers living adjacent to areas that were supposed to remain under permanent forest cover. As a first test case of applying these rules, the village of Lubuk Beringing (Bungo
district, Jambi province) in the ‘watershed protection forest’ buffer zone of the Kerinci Seblat National Park applied for such an agreement. On March 30, 2009 the Minister of Forestry personally handed over to the village officials the implementation decree SK No. 109/Menhut-II/2009 that assigned an area of 2,356 ha of the Bukit Panjang-Rantau Bayur forest to the management of Lubuk Beringin, subject to the approval of annual workplans. KKI-WARSI provides the background on the process that had to be followed by the village and its supporters at the district level, assisted by NGO’s and an international research organization. Previous investment in bonding and bridging forms of social capital in the village allowed the proposal to be made and approved, assisted by the ambition of Jambi province to be an early adopter of REDD schemes to reduce emissions from deforestation and forest degradation. Progress is being made on options to scale up the process to other villages at reduced transaction costs.

The decision on the village forest area of Lubuk Beringin village can be seen as the first stepping stone to develop a scheme of village forests for the villages around Lubuk Beringin. The process of replication has started from Bukit Panjang, Bukit Pohong in Telang River, and Bukit Singirik up to Bukit Rantau Bayur in Senamat Ulu village. The area makes up a single parcel of protected forest area in Bukit Panjang-Rantau Bayur that is 13,529.40 hectares in size. The results of the replication can be promoted as a model for managing forest areas together with village societies under a clear and certain legal framework.

Bungo has a Forest Governance Learning Group (FGLG), which has become a place to have open discussion on active change to improve the forest structure. This forum is informal and the topics of the discussion are free flowing. The members of the forum do not represent institutions, but are based on individuals, who want to make forestry in Bungo the best in Indonesia. They have had meetings and are working together to push the replication of village forests. The village communities of Senamat Ulu, Dusun Buat, Dusun Laman Panjang, and Dusun Sungai Telang, which are located in the area of protected forest Bukit Panjang-Rantau Bayur, have joined with KKI-WARSI to present a proposal for the administration of the village forest to the head of the district and then to the government of Bungo District, to facilitate the issue of the decision letter by the Minister regarding the village forest.

j) Colombia University Students Research: A Framework for understanding REDD in Muara Bungo

A team of three students from Columbia University’s School of International and Public Affairs (SIPA) has worked on this project as the capstone workshop of the Master of International Affairs program. The students worked with ICRAF on an REDD project being conducted in Jambi, Sumatra. The specific objective outlined by ICRAF is: “The local perspective on REDD as compared to the international negotiations”.

22
This encompasses:
1) Level of readiness;
2) National/provincial level policy analysis, including land rights and regulations; and,
3) Links to the compliance market and international negotiations.

The objective is to evaluate the level of readiness that ICRAF currently possesses with respect to: (a) marrying local perspectives on REDD projects with Indonesia's national and provincial REDD framework; and (b) analyzing post-2012 REDD schemes in the global climate change negotiation regime and identifying challenges and opportunities ahead.

The student research period covers January to May 2010, and they finished field data collection in the third week of January; the final report will be submitted in May 2010.

However, their preliminary findings indicated amongst other things:
1. Awareness of REDD in Muara Bungo district and Jambi province stems from: a) Bali COP 13; b) NGO education programs; c) NGO collaboration projects; d) Local Government officials working to spread knowledge; and e) early phase of REDD working group;
2. The level of awareness of stakeholders is varied, and mostly is due to NGO involvement in REDD-based projects already undertaken;
3. There are contrasting interests between neighbouring villages in Muara Bungo, where villages with high awareness of environmental issues were more advanced in managing their environment in terms of administration, planning, institutions, and management of their resources, while the opposite conditions occurred in the villages with low environmental awareness;
4. Issues that are affecting stakeholder participation in terms of governance and the institutional setting are: a) corruption; b) lack of transparency and accountability; c) illegal logging; d) land tenure; e) weak law enforcement; f) encroachment; g) forest fire (only affecting the provincial level government and NGOs); and h) technical constraints;
5. Policies encouraging stakeholders participation in the REDD arena are: a) recognition of Hutan Desa; b) No. 41/1999 (where adat rights are recognized); c) PP 3/2008 (establishment of FMU); and d) PP 6/2007 (protection forest-PES license but can be used to distribute REDD payments to main actors);
6. Most of the local stakeholders prefer the REDD payment to be channelled from the buyer
to local government and then to the provider/community; and
7. Concerning the distribution of REDD revenue among stakeholders, it is expected that the
community should receive a greater compensation percentage, and the developers
receive less, while within government, a greater allocation to local government is
expected.

k) The Role of People Forest and Agroforestry as Carbon Stocks in Prigen Subdistrict, Pasuruan District

Agroforestry provides an alternative means to increase carbon stock on degraded lands.
Agroforestry is an agricultural system with trees that is capable of preserving natural
sustainability and increasing farmer income.
Pasuruan district has considerable potential to sequestrate carbon, with forest cover of
48,849.13 ha, which consists of 31,016.70 ha of state forest and 17,832.43 ha of people
forest. Agroforestry covers 31,432.10 ha of the district’s area, and consists of crops, including
coffee, coconut, cloves, cotton, jambu mete, kenanga, tebu, and other minor commodities.
Therefore, forest in Pasuruan district has the potential to sequestrate carbon and the
opportunity to be developed to support community welfare.
This research is being carried out to gather information concerning the potential of people
forest and agroforestry (with different land utilization systems) as means of sequestering
carbon (C), especially in the Prigen sub district of Pasuruan district. The collected data is
expected to be used to support negotiations on the REDD mechanism.

l) Roles of Trees in Stabilizing Cliffs in Prigen Subdistrict, Pasuruan District

For fragile land, located on peak slopes, large areas of tree plantations with high stocking are
predicted to increase the risk of landslides during the rainy season, due to the heavy burden
on a relatively shallow root system that will add weight to the slopes and trigger a landslide.
Therefore, tree species need to be selected that do not have a high biomass, but have a deep
and strong root system, to increase the conservation value (ecology) of agroforestry land.
Pasuruan district contains the largest people forest centre in East Java, with a forest area of
48,849.13 ha, which consists of 31,016.70 ha of state forestry, while agroforestry occupies
31,432.10 ha and commonly consists of mixed timber, fruit trees, and other commodities. In
addition to preserving carbon stocks, the aforementioned system also could preserve
hydrological functions and biological diversity.
The plantations of various tree species in the agroforestry system are expected to be able to
increase water absorption by their root systems in the soils, reducing losses due to landslides.
As the evaluation of tree roots in agroforestry systems has not yet been carried out in
Pasuruan district, it is a high priority.
**Output Delivery:**

1) Improved version of Fair, Efficient REDD Value Chain Allocation (FERVA): Fair and efficient? How stakeholders view investments to avoid deforestation in Indonesia

2) The method of FERVA also duplicated in the project in Peru and funded by other donor. Policy Brief: Perceptions on Fairness and Efficiency of the REDD Value Chain (Methods and results from pilot analyses in Indonesia and Peru)

3) Reports on sub-granted research and activities:
   a. Fair, Efficient and Sustainable Emission Reduction from Land Use in Indonesia (FESERLUI) workshop in Kapuas, Central Kalimantan
   b. Market chain analysis for rubber commodity to increase farmer access to market
   c. Assessment of REDD Policy and Distribution Payment in Gorontalo Province
   d. Fair, Efficient and Sustainable Emission Reduction from Land Use in Indonesia (FESERLUI) workshop in Muara Bungo, Jambi
   e. Social Conflict in Forest Resource Utilization (Case Study of Twelve Hills National Park (TNBD), Province of Jambi)
   g. Questioning Papua Readiness: Key Efforts by the Provincial Government for the Success of REDD in the Context of Special Autonomy (Otonomi Khusus)
   h. Bungo Carbon Program: Forest Preservation and Climate Change Mitigation Concept (embryo of REDD working group in Bungo)
   i. Field Facilitation of villages Surround Bukit Panjang Rantau Bayur area, Bungo District
   j. Colombia University Students Research: A Framework for understanding REDD in Muara Bungo
   k. People Forest and Agroforestry Role as Carbon Stock at Prigen Sub district, Pasuruan District
   l. Roles of trees in stabilizing cliffs in Prigen Sub district, Pasuruan District

4) Articles published in ICRAF SEA the Tales on workshop carried out in project sites
   a. Supporting local stakeholders understanding on the potential REDD mechanism in Indonesia (Report from FESERLUI workshop in Palangkaraya, 10-12 March 2009)
   b. Raising Local Stakeholders Awareness on Potential REDD Scheme Implementation (Report from FESERLUI workshop in Pasuruan, East Java, 18 – 19 August 2009)
   c. Turning Green Gold into REDD: Efficient and Fair Carbon Trade Mechanism (Report from FESERLUI project workshop in Jayapura, Papua, 31 October 2009)
d. Grinding REDD bedrock: REDD preparation workshop on Efficient and Fair Carbon Trade Mechanism (Report from FESERLUI project workshop in Banjarbaru, South Kalimantan, 10 – 11 December 2009)

5) Resource person for Jakarta Post Weekender article for February 2010 titled: Better off REDD, by Hana Miller.

List of Collaborators:
1. Wetlands International Indonesian Program (WIIP)
2. Environmental Study, Education, and Training Centre (LP3LH) – Central Kalimantan
3. Indonesian Conservation Community (KKI) WARSI
4. Forestry and Crop Estate Agency (Dishutbun) – Muara Bungo
5. Tropical Agriculture Study Centre - Gorontalo State University (UNG)
6. Kaliandra Sejati Foundation
7. Forest Area Gazette Agency (BPKH wilayah X)
8. Faculty of Forestry – Lambung Mangkurat University

List of Students Involved
1. **IDRIS SARDI**  
   *Social Conflict in Forest Resource Utilization (Case Study of Twelve Hills National Park (TNBD), Province of Jambi)*  
   - Master Candidate of Human Ecology Faculty, Majoring in Village Sociology, Minor in Agrarian Movement and Political Ecology judul study – Bogor Agricultural University  
   - Lecturer of Agriculture Faculty, Batang Hari University, Jambi

2. **Intern from School of International and Public Affairs, Columbia University, New York**  
   *A Framework for understanding REDD in Muara Bungo*  
   - **Rumi Naito**  
     Master of International Affairs, 2010 Concentration in Environmental Policy Studies  
   - **Jennifer Davis**  
     Master of International Affairs: Economic and Political Development & East Asian Studies  
   - **Audrey Desiderato**  
     Master of International Affairs, International Energy Management and Policy

3. **Brawijaya University Students**  
   - **Amelia Tri Cahyani**  
     *People Forest and Agroforestry Role as Carbon Stock at Prigen Sub district, Pasuruan District*  
     Faculty of Agriculture – Majoring in Soil Sciences  
   - **Rika Ratna Sari**  
     *Roles of trees in stabilizing cliffs in Prigen Sub district, Pasuruan District*  
     Faculty of Agriculture – Majoring in Soil Sciences
Workshop Evaluation:

To increase the quality of the workshop and to assess the success of achieving target outcomes, in every workshop, participants were asked to evaluate the workshop by filling out a questionnaire prepared by ICRAF.

a) Quantified evaluation
The following table shows the results of the quantified evaluation in various categories, based on the participants’ satisfaction ratings.

Table 3. Frequency analysis of workshop evaluation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Evaluation (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Excellent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content/material</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of facilitator</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workshop arrangement</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benefits for participants</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall evaluation</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall, the workshop quality was rated above average (10% excellent and 74% good). Content was ranked very highly on the satisfaction scale (43% excellent and 49% good), and the quality of the facilitator and workshop arrangements were also above average. Additionally, the participants perceived that the workshop benefits were beyond their initial expectations.

b) Specific comments and suggestions from the capacity building workshop evaluation at the project sites

Workshops were conducted to improve stakeholder capacity at each site. Post-workshop feedback was required from stakeholders to evaluate progress and additional needs. The key comments and suggestions raised by the stakeholders were:

Comments:
1. The language used for the presentation was too complicated for most participants and some of them felt uncomfortable, due to difficulties in following the materials.
2. There should be agreed regulations among the participants to keep the workshop effective and efficient.
3. REDD is still in the phase of socialization, therefore its benefit cannot be proven yet and this resulted in the local community having high expectations (which may prove unrealistic in the future).
4. Workshops should be implemented in a more interactive way and over a longer period, because it was felt there was a lack of depth in the study.
5. Some of the participants did not fully understand the concept of REDD.
6. The topic of potential funds and fund distribution should be avoided until i) stakeholders gain a basic understanding of the REDD concept, and ii) funding sources have been
identified and secured (nearly). Main point: avoid raising expectations and attracting rent seekers.

7. The materials provided for some tools were good, but the material for other tools has not yet been tested.

8. The complexity of the information aimed to be transferred at the workshops was too high. Organizers assumed all participants understood the issues very well, while in fact some participants did not understand the issues at all.

9. Time allocation for material delivered was too short, and caused the presenters to hurry, which made the presentations less effective and material delivering sub-optimal.

10. There should be more background information concerning carbon emissions and the related history.

11. The facilitator should not only enhance the interaction between different groups, but also provide possible solution-based experiences from other regions.

**Suggestions:**

1. There should be a feasibility study implemented before the initial workshop. This would better inform participants regarding possibilities at their location and enhance participation during the workshop and commitment to REDD options.

2. Presentation should be delivered in a simpler way, but still be focused on the same key issues.

3. After the workshop, relevant follow-up activities should be implemented to maintain interest and momentum. Development of a draft post-workshop work plan should be a part of the workshop.

4. Case studies were lacking. Stakeholders expected that the workshops would address the specific problems of their sites, not just provide generalities.

5. Global issues related to REDD should be socialized more.

6. Carbon accounting and the economic aspect of REDD should be explained to participants in detail. ICRAF is expected to facilitate this activity. *(Note: This suggestion must be balanced with Comment #6 above which stressed not raising the question of ‘funding’ until participants have developed sufficient understanding and a source of funding has been identified.)*

7. The number of workshop participants should be increased to achieve greater impact and local buy-in.

8. Intensive coordination with collaborating institutions is required to assure that they are informed and committed to REDD and the workshop. This is essential to achieve the objectives of the workshop and to develop a foundation for potential REDD schemes.

9. During working group sessions, a facilitator, who has a good knowledge of REDD and the topical issue, should guide each group.
10. It would be better to involve the participants in a series of workshops and training initiated by ICRAF, so that intensive capacity building could be achieved, to increase local stakeholders’ capacity.

11. There should be an introductory session to produce a more even level of understanding regarding REDD and of expectations regarding the workshop. Additionally, there should be a pre- and post-test to document the REDD knowledge gained and the impact of the workshop.

12. At the end of each session, the moderator should summarize the discussion results in order to enhance participants’ comprehension.

13. It is expected that ICRAF will follow-up on suggestions and questions raised during the workshops, regarding REDD scheme implementation and related Ministry of Forestry regulations.

14. There should be a more explicit linkage made between the tools/approaches discussed during the workshops and their relevance to REDD schemes. The strength and weakness of the tools/approaches should be emphasized.

15. There should be clearer explanation of how tools fit into problem-solving models.

16. There should be more discussion on how and why tools should be used by participants, and this should be specifically linked to practical and appropriate follow-up activities (see Suggestion # 3).

17. In any follow-up activities, there should be strong emphasis placed on practical sessions guided by sufficient background information, for example two days of theory and two days of practice.

18. Follow-up activities should be more strongly focused on technical aspects and field application (practical enabling information).

19. Follow-up activities (workshops) should be conducted at the local level, because the local community provides the first-hand actors.